

Analysis Of Citation In Undergraduate Law Projects In Faculties Of Law Libraries In Anambra And Enugu States Of Nigeria

Dr. Mercy Ifeyinwa Anyaegbu CLN^{1*}, Prof. Virginia Dike²

^{1*}Festus Aghagbo Library,
Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Nigeria.

²Department of Library and Information Science,
University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria.

Accepted 14 July, 2016.

ABSTRACT

The study sought to find out secondary sources of undergraduate law students cite in their research projects. The study further sought to determine most frequently cited sources as well as their availability in faculty of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria. Five research questions guided the study. Survey research design was adopted for the study. A total of 543 projects were used for the study. Checklist and interview were the instrument for data collection. Data collected were analysed using descriptive statistics of frequencies and percentages to answer research questions 1, 2 and 3. Responses from the law librarians in research questions 4 and 5 were qualitatively analysed. The result of the analysis revealed that most of the information sources cited were not available in the four law libraries studied. Challenges facing law librarians in the provision and availability of these resources were highlighted. The study also made recommendations that will enhance the availability and utilisation of these information sources in faculty of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria were recommended.

Keywords: citation analysis, secondary sources, textbooks, journals, research projects, law libraries, Anambra State, Enugu State.

Introduction

Citation is a crucial aspect of research output. A citation simply put is a reference to a published or unpublished work. According to Thomson (2014) citations are the references researchers append to their papers to explicitly show earlier work which they have depended on to conduct their own investigations. Such a reference normally contains important bibliographic details such as the author of the work being cited, title of the work, edition, and date of publication. A citation is both a signpost and an acknowledgement (Hunter and College, 2014). As a signpost, it signals the location of the work being cited. As an acknowledgement, it reveals the indebtedness of the researcher to the cited work. A citation can appear in different formats: within the text (in-text) at the bottom of the page (footnotes), or at the end of the paper (endnotes). The mechanics of citing are complicated and vary depending on the discipline involved. Citation analysis, on the other hand, is a branch of information science in which researchers study the way articles in a scholarly field are accessed and referenced by others (Meho, 2007). According to Regents (2015), citation analysis is the study of the impact and assumed quality of an article, an author or an institution based on the number of times works and/ or authors have been cited by others. Citation analysis is used to find out how much impact a particular article has had, by showing which other authors based some work upon it or cited it as an example within their own papers. It is also used to find out more about a field or topic and to determine how much impact a particular author has had by looking at the total number of citations. Citation analysis is performed by counting how many times either a paper or researcher is cited by others. It works on the assumption that influential scientists and important works are cited more frequently than others.

The writing of research project is an essential requirement for the award of Bachelor of Law degree (LL.B). The project topics may cover a wide range of subjects in law.

Research projects in law have some unique features which make them different from research projects in other disciplines. A typical research project in law is similar to a law textbook. According to Dada (2011) legal research and ability to find the law is a most useful weapon without which no lawyer can thrive and survive in Nigeria. It is the search for authority and materials that are in the law books and publications stocked away in the various legal collections. The ability to perform legal research is one of the basic skills of a lawyer and starts quite early as part of a lawyer's training right from his undergraduate days at the Faculty of Law and the Law School. This in effect means that all members of the legal profession, including the law teachers, law students, post-graduate students and most importantly, members of the Bar and the Bench should be involved in legal research as a matter of routine. They should know how, and where to find the law with relative ease and minimum guidance from the law librarian.

The law librarian has a crucial to play to enhance effective utilisation of various research materials in the law library. Both the National Universities Commission and the Council For Legal Education recommend that the law faculty must have a law library with a qualified librarian preferably a lawyer, with right complement of staff. According to Dada (2011), the law librarian should possess adequate knowledge of the basic legal service and the salient components of his collection in order to be able to foster autonomy and confidence both of which are essential attributes of a given profession. It is the duty of the law librarian to provide the appropriate texts and to guide the prospective lawyers on how to access information from them. This is crucial aspect

of legal education. A lawyer cannot memorise all the law and he is not expected to. The best lawyers are those who know best how and where to find the law whenever the need arises.

Information resources in law can be categorized into two namely, primary sources and secondary sources. Primary sources are the rules of law that are binding upon the courts, government, and individuals. Examples are statutes, regulations, court orders and court decisions. They are generated by legislators, courts and administrative agencies. The principal legal sources of Nigerian law are therefore the Constitution; local statutes; case law; English law comprising Acts or Orders-in-Council applying directly to Nigeria; statutes of general application, the common law and doctrines of equity and customary law (Asein, 2005). Secondary sources are commentaries on law that do not have binding effect but explain what the law is or should be (Legal Information Institute, 2010). Secondary sources according to Obidinma & Ezeh (2011) are made up of textbooks, journals, digests, reference sources etc. they are not binding but can have persuasive effect in the law court.

The availability of information sources needed for research in faculty of law libraries is crucial in legal research. Availability of information sources means ensuring their presence in libraries for immediate use (Aguolu and Aguolu, 2002). This is so because as soon as a library user encounters difficulty in locating and using the material of one's choice, frustration sets in and this may affect the end product of such research. References cited in these research reports not only present the origins of student's researches but also show students' information literacy in retrieving, accessing and selecting information resources (Szu-chia, 2007). The availability of cited resources in the library collection is one way of proving that the law library supports the research effort of the faculty.

Statement of the Problem

Legal research is not only useful in the promotion of legal education; it is also a vital and most indispensable tool in the modern day practice of law. The conduct of legal research requires the use of both primary and secondary source materials. These information sources in law can be obtained from a good law library. In spite of the crucial role law libraries play both in legal education and the legal practice, these libraries currently appear to be under-resourced. This situation becomes a matter of serious concern when one considers its impact on the quality of legal practitioners which are being produced in Nigerian universities and the future of the legal profession in Nigeria. Further, undergraduate law students may not have access to the full range of legal sources they require for research in the faculty of law libraries. It is not known through research if the information sources cited in the undergraduate projects in law are available in the faculty of law libraries of universities, particularly those in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria.. The central question posed by this study is, what secondary sources of law are cited in undergraduate law projects and are the cited sources available to students in the law libraries of these universities?

Purpose of the Study

The main purpose of this study is to analyse citations in undergraduate law projects in faculty of law libraries in

Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria . Specifically, the study sought to find out the:

1. type of secondary source resources undergraduate law students cite in their research projects in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria;
2. secondary sources resources that are most frequently cited in law projects in faculties of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria;
3. availability of the cited sources in the faculties of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria;
4. challenges law librarians encounter in the provision of cited information sources to law students in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria, and
5. Strategies law librarians can adopt to improve the availability and utilisation of information sources cited in undergraduate law projects in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria.

Research Questions

The following research questions guided the study:

1. What secondary sources of law are cited in undergraduate research projects in faculty of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria?
2. What are the most frequently cited secondary sources in undergraduate law projects in faculties of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria?
3. What cited sources are available in faculties of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria?
4. What challenges do law librarians encounter in the provision of information sources to law students in faculties of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu states of Nigeria?
5. What strategies can law librarians adopt to improve the availability and utilisation of information sources cited in undergraduate projects in faculty of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu states of Nigeria?

Review of Related Literature

Cited sources in the library are generated by the authors, publishers, vendors and all stake holders in the book production. The library acquires these information sources for their users. These sources appear in different forms such as textbooks, law reports, statutes, journals, research reports, reference sources among others. Some are in electronic format such as online databases. The availability of these information sources in the library depends to a large extent on the acquisition policy and the financial strength of the library. Users who consult these sources in the library include students, lecturers, other members of staff, and all those who use these materials in the conduct of their research. Their research output is usually published as research report, journal articles, books, statutes, law reports, among others. There is therefore a tripartite relationship that exists between the cited sources, the citer and author of the cited sources.

Citation analysis is a bibliometric technique. The term bibliometrics was first coined by Pritchard in 1969. According to Pritchard (1969), bibliometrics is the application of mathematics and statistical methods to books and other media of communication. Rubin (2010) defined citation analysis as the examination of the frequency, patterns, and graphs of citations in articles and books. From an application

point of view, citation analysis may be considered as a collaborative peer effort to analyze and promote the quality of scholarly publication and research. According to Meho (2007), citation analysis is performed by counting how many times a paper or researcher is cited.

This is based on the assumption that influential scholars and important works are cited more than others. Ibeum and Madu (2002) posit that citation analysis is the analysis of the information sources used by authors when composing the content of their texts. The assumption is that there is an intellectual link between the citing sources and the reference article. The relationship between the citing document and the cited references rests on a number of assumptions, two of the most important being (1) actual use of the cited document by the citing author and (2) citation of the best possible works. Given these assumptions of value and actual use, a citation can be viewed as a relevant artifact of use data. Further, citation checking of research documents and comparison of those citations with the availability of materials in a local collection offers an unobtrusive and cost-effective method of evaluating that collection's ability to support research (Sylvia, 1998).

Citation analysis may be conducted for various reasons. According to Grochowski (2014), citation analysis may be performed for the following:

- To establish the impact that a particular work has had by identifying which other authors based their work upon it or cited their own papers
- To learn more about a field or a topic by identifying seminal works in that area
- To determine what impact a particular author has had within his/her own discipline and beyond by looking at his/her total number of citations broken down by discipline and by country
- For promotion and tenure purposes by looking at the quality of sources where a scholar's work has been published and cited.

Citation analysis is now commonly used to determine what titles to purchase, to continue or to weed. The analysis of these citations can also be used to determine the timeliness of cited sources (Ogunronbi, 1998; Nikko & Adetoro, 2007), authorship pattern in a field (Omekwu & Atinmo, 1998); frequently cited sources (Oki, 2003; Sam & Tackie, 2008), as well as citations made to electronic sources. This technique is a helpful tool for the library management in the selection and weeding of materials in the face of ever expanding information environment (Kumar and Reddy, 2012).

Citation analysis is now being used for various purposes in library and information science profession. Meho (2007) posited that the basic idea of using citation-based measures to assess the impact, importance or quality of a scientist's overall work is to show how often and where he or she is cited. When scientists seek research grant, file for tenure or promotion, or apply for staff or faculty positions, it has become customary to include both the impact factor scores of the journals in which their papers were published and the number of citations received by these articles. As high impact journals usually attract high-quality contributions from top scientists and have a large readership, publishing in these journals is a top priority for scientists who want to increase

their visibility, prestige and influence among their peers; it also improves their chances of getting lucrative job offers and research grants.

There is a long history of citation studies in law. Shapiro (1991) observed that although information science literature frequently repeats the assertion that the earliest instance of citation analysis was a citation analysis conducted by Gross and Gross in 1927 in which they tabulated references in the *Journal of the American Chemical Society*, legal citation analysis antedates this "first" by at least thirty- three years. The use of footnote as a method of making reference to cited material first appeared in the 16th century (White, 1985). This citation method in research was not explored until Frank Shepard published his *Shepard's Citation* in 1873. In the legal field, *Shepard Citation* is a highly regarded citation index. It allows researchers to track particular judicial decisions, statutes and other legal resources as they are invoked at different historical moments for a range of purpose. *Shepard's Citation* provides references to when and how cases and law review articles were cited by other sources.

Information sources in law can be categorized into primary sources and secondary sources. Primary sources are those which state the law (rules that local, state and federal government will enforce). Sources of primary law include ordinances, statutes, treaties, court decisions, court rules, administrative rules and regulations, administrative agency decisions, and executive orders and decrees (King Country Law Library, 2008). Secondary sources of law are materials that help find the law or explain or comment on it but are not "the law itself" unlike primary resources; they do not have the power to affect legal rights, and are referred to instead for their instructive value and for the references they provide to relevant primary sources of law. Secondary legal resources include textbooks, legal journals, legal encyclopedias, and case law digests / summaries. Because of the broad overview of the law they provide, secondary legal resources can be an excellent starting point for legal research (Americalegalnet, 2006). They are tools for effective research in law. According to the 2007 NUC Benchmark, the law programme is designed to ensure that the graduate of law will have good general knowledge of law, including a clear understanding of the place and importance of law in society. The programme should introduce students to the general knowledge in law, acquaint them with principles of judicial process and legal development, and equip them the basic tools of legal analysis and methods. The curriculum of legal education in Nigeria is, therefore, aimed at ensuring that law is taught as it exists at any given moment, and that every law student will be comparative in his approach to legal studies bearing in mind that there are many systems of law (Statutory law, Common law, Customary law and Islamic law) currently in operation.

Sequel to this, the curriculum for law programme in Nigeria is made up of compulsory law and non law courses as well as some optional courses. The compulsory law courses are Legal Method, Constitutional Law, Law of Contract, Criminal Law, Company Law, Commercial Law, Law of Equity and Trusts, Law of Evidence, Jurisprudence, Property Law, Nigerian Legal System, Law of Torts and Compulsory Essay in the Final year. The optional law course is an open list made up of twenty five elective courses. Courses in this category include

Administrative Law, Industrial/Labour Law, Oil and gas Law, Public International Law, Family Law, Intellectual Property Law, Conflict of Laws, Conveyancing, Criminology, Revenue/Taxation Law, Introduction to Islamic Law, Law of Banking, Law of Insurance, Maritime Law, Environmental Law, Human Rights and Nigerian Law, Customary Law, African Comparative Law, ICT Law, Health Law or Law and Medicine, Islamic Law of Crimes and Torts, Islamic Law of Transactions, Islamic Law of Procedure and Evidence, Islamic Family Law and Succession and Islamic Jurisprudence.

Availability of information sources means ensuring their presence in libraries for immediate use. Aguolu and Aguolu (2002) argue that availability should be viewed from both national and institutional levels. They attribute the lack of availability of information sources to the steady proliferation of universities: federal, state, and private, along with increases in students and faculty, and the diversification of courses and academic research programmes, without adequate information sources to meet the actual information needs. Dike (1992) conducted a research on the scarcity of books in Nigeria and the threat to academic excellence. She was able to establish that non availability of information sources has led faculty and students not to use library services. When law students encounter difficulty in sourcing for information materials they require for research in the library, it may result in a number of unpleasant consequences. First, it may affect their interest in using the law library for future research. Secondly, they may resort to using their personal collection. Thirdly it may affect the quality of their research. A more disturbing aspect of this frustration is the quality of legal practitioners being produced by Nigerian universities.

This situation is further amplified by scholars in the literature. Buckland cited in Ugah (2008) analysed frustration felt by

users who fail to find the information sources they want in the library. Buckland outlined four relationships between the user and availability of resources. He opined that the greater the popularity of the information resources, the lower the immediate availability. Secondly that the longer the loan period, the lower the immediate availability, the shorter the loan period, the higher the immediate availability. Thirdly that the greater the popularity, the shorter the loan period and the lesser the popularity, the longer the loan period can be. Fourthly, that increasing the number of copies that is available, like shortening the length of loan period, increases the immediate availability.

Methodology

The study adopted a research design. The sample size comprised of 543 undergraduate research projects drawn from four university law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria. The universities selected were University of Nigeria, Nsukka; Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka; Enugu State University of Science and Technology and Anambra State University, Uli. All the citations in the 543 projects were used for the study. Four law librarians were interviewed. Checklist and interview were the instrument for data collection. The data collected was analysed using descriptive statistics of frequencies and percentages to answer research questions 1, 2 and 3. The results were presented in tables. Responses from the law librarians were qualitatively analysed. Decision rule to determine most frequently cited items was based on cited sources with up to 40 citations and above.

Results

1. Research Question 1: *What secondary sources of law are cited in undergraduate research projects in faculty of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria?*

Table 1: Type of Cited Sources

Sources	ANSU	ESUT	NAU	UNN	Total	%
Textbooks	1-875	976	3-524	3-413	9-788	94.15
Journals	102	71	299	136	608	5.85
TOTAL /Percentage Per University	1977 (19.02)	1047 (10.07)	3823 (36.77)	3549 (34.14)	10396	100

Table I shows the type of secondary sources cited by undergraduate law students in their research projects. The result as presented in this table indicates that textbook is the dominant sources cited by undergraduate law students in their research projects. The study generated a total of 10396 citations. Out of this number, textbooks have the highest citation of 9788 which accounts for 94.15%. Citation from journal is quite low. From the table, journal citation is 608 representing 5.85%.

Research Question 2: *What are the most frequently cited secondary sources in undergraduate law projects in faculties of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria?*

Tables 2-8 present the result of the analysis on the most frequently cited secondary sources. Major subjects studied

were grouped into compulsory core law courses and optional core law courses in the analysis for textbooks. While law journals were classified into foreign and local. Cited sources with 40 citations and above were identified as most frequently cited for textbooks, and 20 citations and above for journals.

Table 2: Frequently Cited Core Law Textbooks

S/N	Title	Subject	No. of Projects	No. of Citations
1	Accident and Motor Insurance in West Africa	Comm..Law	49	49
2	Business Law in Nigeria - G.Ezejiofor <i>et al</i>	Comm..Law	48	48
3	A Practical Introduction to Copyright- O.Orojo	Comm..Law	47	47
4	Commercial Law - M.C.Okany	Comm..Law	45	45
5	Law of Negotiable Instruments- K.I.Igweike	Comm..Law	45	45
6	Law of Consumer Protection-F.N.Monye	Comm..Law	43	43
7	Consumer Protection Law in Nigeria:Law, Theory & Practice-Benedict Kanyip	Comm..Law	42	42
8	Nigerian Commercial Law-M.C.Okany	Comm..Law	41	41
9	Nigerian Commercial Law-K.I.Igweike	Comm..Law	40	40
10	Sale of Goods (6th Ed.) -P.S.Atiyah	Comm..Law	40	40
11	Introduction to Legal Nigerian Method-A.O.Sanni	Legal System	45	45
12	Nigerian Legal System-A.O.Obilade	Legal System	45	45
13	Introduction to Nigerian Legal System - J. O. Asien	Legal System	43	43
14	Nigerian Legal System-T.O. Elias	Legal System	42	42
15	Modern Nigerian Law of Evidence (2nd ed.) - Fidelis Nwadialo.	Evidence	42	42
16	Law and Practice of Evidence in Nigeria - Afe Babalola	Evidence	43	43
17	Law and Practice Relating to Evidence in Nigeria (2nd ed.) - AkinolaAguda.	Evidence	43	43
18	An Introduction to Equity in Nigeria-G.Kodilinye	Equity	40	40
19	Principles of Criminal Liability in Nigerian Law- T. Aguda & Okagbue	Criminal Law	67	67
20	Criminal Code Companion-E.O.Fakayode	Criminal Law	65	65
21	Okonkwo And Naish on Criminal Law in Nigeria - C.O. Okonkwo	Criminal Law	65	65
22	The Nigerian Criminal Trial Procedure-O.A. Onadeko	Criminal Law	65	65
23	Criminal Procedure In Southern Nigeria - Oluwatoyin Doherty	Criminal Law	63	63
24	Criminal Procedure Act: Synoptic Guide- Olayide Olakanmi	Criminal Law	62	62
25	Criminal Procedure in Nigeria-Oluwatoyin Doherty	Criminal Law	62	62
26	Criminology And Criminal Justice - A.B Dambazu	Criminal Law	61	61
27	Law and Criminality- A B.Dambazu	Criminal Law	55	55
28	Defences of Criminal Inability in Nigerian Law- Icharisu Chukkol	Criminal Law	50	50
29	Principles of Criminal Law in Nigeria-A Aguda	Criminal Law	48	48
30	History and Sources of Nigerian Criminal Law-A.G. Karibi Whyte	Criminal Law	40	40
31	History and Sources of Criminal Law- A.G.Karibi-Whyte	Criminal Law	40	40
32	Introduction to the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria-J.O.Akande	Constitut. Law	62	62
33	Cases and Materials on Constitutional Law in Nigeria - P.A Oluyede	Constitut. Law	61	61
34	Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria-I. Smith	Constitut. Law	60	60
35	Constitutional and Administrative Law - A.W Bradley	Constitut. Law	57	57
36	The Nigerian Constitutional Law-Ese Malemi	Constitut. Law	56	56
37	Judicialism in Commonwealth Africa- B.O.Nwabueze	Constitut. Law	56	56
38	Modern Constitutional Law in Nigeria-B.O.Igwenyi	Constitut. Law	56	56
39	Constitutional and Administrative Law in Nigeria-P.A.Oluyede	Constitut. Law	54	54
40	Cases and Materials on Constitutional Law in Nigeria- P.A.Oluyede	Constitut. Law	53	53
41	Federalism in Nigeria under the Presidential Constitution - B.O.Nwabueze	Constitut. Law	51	51

Table 2 Cont.

S/N	Title	Subject	No. of Projects	No. of Citations
42	Constitutional Law in Nigeria- P.A.Oluyede	Constitut. Law	50	50
43	Election and Practice Law in Nigeria- Afe Babalola	Constitut. Law	46	46
44	Legal Drafting and Conveyancing - S. O. Imhanobe	Property Law	60	60
45	A Practical Approach to RealPropertyI. O. Smith	Property Law	56	56
46	NigerianLand Law -T.O.Elias	Property Law	53	53
47	Modern Nigerian Land Law-P.A.O.Oluyede	Property Law	52	52
48	NigerianLand Law - B. O. Nwabueze	Property Law	51	51
49	Nigerian Law of Property - M. C. Okany	Property Law	50	50
50	Possession of Land -J.A.Omotola	Property Law	50	50
51	Issues in ContemporaryLand Law-I.A.Umezulike	Property Law	46	46
52	Cases on the Land Use Act-J.A.Omotola	Property Law	45	45
53	Introduction to Nigerian Land Law-C.O.Okonkwo	Property Law	45	45
54	Land Use Act-J.A.Omotola	Property Law	45	45
55	Principles and Practice of Land Law-J.N.Egwumuo	Property Law	45	45
56	Law of Landlord and Tenant - EmekaChianu	Property Law	44	44
57	57The Iboh Law of Property-S.N.C. Obi	Property Law	42	42
58	Nigerian Law of Landlord and Tenant - M.O. Onwuamaegbu	Property Law	41	41
59	Cases and Materials on NigerianLand Law - Niki Tobi	Property Law	40	40
60	Land Use Act-I.O.Smith	Property Law	40	40
61	Manual of Igbo Customary Law-S.N.C.Obi	Property Law	40	40
62	NigerianLand Use Act- R.W.James	Property Law	40	40
63	Security of Title to Land in Nigeria-I.O.Smith	Property Law	40	40

The core subjects as recorded in this table cover commercial law, legal system, evidence, equity, criminal law, constitutional law, and property law. From the Table, it can be seen that *Principles of Criminal Liability in Nigerian Law* by Aguda and Okagbue received the highest citation of 67. This is closely followed by *Criminal Code Companion* by Fakayode, Okonkwo and Naish on *Criminal Law in Nigeria* and *The Nigerian Criminal Trial Procedure* by Onadeko. Each received 65 citations. Other criminal law texts with 60 citations and above were *Criminal Procedure Act: Synoptic Guide* by O. Olakanmi and *Criminology and Criminal Justice* by Dambazu. Constitutional law texts were also highly rated. Three

constitutional law texts received 60 citations and above. They are *Introduction to the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria* by J.O.Akande, *Cases and Materials on Constitutional Law in Nigeria* by P.A.Oluyede, and *Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria* by I.O.Smith. Another subject of law that received very high citation is *Property Law. Legal Drafting and Conveyancing* by Imanobe has 60 citations. It can be observed from the analysis that areas of law with 40 citations and above are commercial law, criminal law, constitutional law, property law, law of evidence, legal system/method and equity. Altogether 63 law textbooks were recorded as highly cited in this table.

Table 3: Frequently Cited Optional Core Law Textbooks

Title	Subject	No. of Projects	No. of Citations
Nigeria Administrative Law- P.A Oluyede	Administrative Law	41	41
Administrative Law-W.R. Wade	Administrative Law	40	40
The Law of Arbitration in Nigeria-Gauis Ezejiofor	Arbitratration.	40	40
Labour Law- A. Emiola	Labour/Industrial	40	40
Labour Law in Nigeria - E. E. Uvieghara	Labour/Industrial	40	40
The Customary Law Manual - S.N.C. Obi	Family	40	40

In Table 3, the result of the analysis on most frequently cited sources in optional core law courses was presented. Subjects of law covered were Administrative law, Law of Arbitration, Labour/Industrial Law and Family Law. Out of the 25 optional law courses prescribed by the NUC, only 5 subject areas or courses received high citation.

Result of the analysis in this table showed that *Nigerian Administrative Law* by P.A. Oluyede has the highest citation of 41. The other five texts received 40 citations each. These are *Administrative Law* by W.R. Wade, *The Law of Arbitration in Nigeria* by Gauis Ezejiofor, *Labour Law in Nigeria* by Emiola, *Labour Law in Nigeria* by Uvieghara and *The Customary Law Manual* by S.N.C. Obi.

Table 4: Foreign Law Journal

S/N	Journals (Foreign)	No. of Projects	No. of Citation
1	Harvard International Law Review	25	25
2	International Legal Materials	25	25
3	ILO Workshop Proceedings	24	24
4	Journal of African Law	23	23
5	Cambridge Law Journal	21	21
6	Cambridge Law Review	20	20
Total		138	138

Table 4 presents results of the analysis on foreign law journal. It can be observed from the table that 6 foreign journals which received 20 citations and above were identified as most frequently cited foreign law journals in undergraduate law projects at the law libraries under review. *Harvard International Law Review* and *International Legal Materials*

were rated highest with 25 citations each. *ILO workshop Proceedings*, *Journal of African Law*, *Cambridge Law Review* received 24, 23, 21 and 20 citations respectively. From the analysis, these six most frequently cited constitute 30% of the most frequently journals in this study.

Table 5: Local Law Journal

S/N	Journals (Local)	No. of Projects	No. of Citation
1	Nigerian Bar Association Journal	37	37
2	Nigerian Law and Practice Journal	35	35
3	UNIZIK Law Journal	34	34
4	University of Benin Law Journal	30	30
5	Modern Practice Journal of Finance and Investment Law	27	27
6	Journal of Contemporary Legal Problems	25	25
7	Journal of Human Rights Law & Practice	24	24
8	Journal of Private and Property Law	23	23
9	Abia State University Law Journal	21	21
10	Current Legal Problems	21	21
11	Ikeja Bar Journal	21	21
12	Journal of Public and Private Law	21	21
13	Ebonyi State University Law Journal	20	20
14	Ilorin Bar Journal	20	20
Total		359	359

Table 5 presents result of the analysis on local law journals. It can be seen from the table that 14 local law journals which received 20 citations and above were identified as most frequently cited local law journals. The highest citation of 37 was received by *Nigerian Bar Journal*. It was closely followed by *Nigerian Law and Practice Journal* and *UNIZIK Law Journal* both of which received 35 and 34 citations respectively. Next in the rank are *University of Benin Law Journal*, *Modern Practice Journal of Contemporary Legal Problems* which has 30, 27, and 25 citations respectively. *Journal of Human Rights*

Law & Practice and *Journal of Private and Property Law* received 24 and 23 citations respectively. Next is *Abia State Law Journal*, *Current Legal problems*, *Ikeja Bar Journal* and *Journal of Public and Private Law* with 21 citations. In the table, *Ebonyi State University Law Journal* and *Ilorin Bar Journal* received the least citation of 20. From the analysis these 14 local journals which were rated as most frequently cited journals account for 70% of the most frequently cited journals in this study.

Table 6: Availability of Cited Core Law Textbooks

S/N	Title/Author	Subject	No. Of Citation	Universities				Total	% Of Total Availability
				ANSU	ESUT	NAU	UNN		
1	Accident and Motor Insurance in West Africa	Commercial Law	49	1	1	1	0	3	3 75
2	Nigerian Business Law- G. Ezejirofor <i>et al</i>	Commercial Law	48	1	0	1	1	3	3 75
3	Nigerian Commercial Law & Practice - Olakunle Orojo	Commercial Law	47	1	1	1	1	4	4 100
4	Insurance Commercial Law- M.C.Okany	Commercial Law	45	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
5	Law of Negotiable Instruments- K.I.Igweike	Commercial Law	45	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
6	Law of Consumer Protection- F.N. Monye	Commercial Law	43	1	0	1	1	3	3 75
7	Consumer Protection in Nigeria: Law, Theory and Practice- Benedict Kanyip	Commercial Law	42	1	0	1	1	3	3 75
8	Nigerian Commercial Law - M. C. Okany	Commercial Law	41	1	1	1	1	4	4 100
9	Nigerian Commercial Law - K.I. Igweike	Commercial Law	40	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
10	The Sale of Goods (6thed). P.S Atiyah	Commercial Law	40	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
11	Introduction to the Constitution of Federal Republic of Nigeria - J.O Akande	Const. Law	62	1	0	1	1	3	3 75
12	The Legitimacy of Constitutional Change in the Context of the 1999 Constitution - Niki Tobi	Const. Law	61	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
13	Presidential Constitution of Nigeria- B.O.Nwabueze	Const. Law	60	1	0	1	1	3	3 75
14	Nigeria: Issues in the 1999 constitution law in Nigeria - Ignatius Ayua	Const. Law	57	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
15	Judicialism in Commonwealth Africa- B.O.Nwabueze	Const. Law	56	0	0	1	0	1	1 25
16	The Nigerian Constitutional Law - EseMalemi.	Const. Law	56	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
17	Modern Constitutional Law in Nigeria - B.O Igwenyi	Const. Law	56	0	0	1	1	2	2 50
18	Constitutional and Administrative Law in Nigeria-Peter Olujede	Const. Law	54	0	1	1	0	2	2 50
19	Cases and Materials on Constitutional Law in Nigeria - P.A Olujede	Const. Law	53	1	0	1	0	2	2 50
20	Federalism in Nigeria under the Presidential Constitution - B.O Nwabueze	Const. Law	51	0	1	1	0	2	2 50
21	Constitutional Law in Nigeria- P.A.Olujede	Const. Law	50	0	1	1	1	3	3 75
22	Election Law and Practice in Nigeria - AfeBabalola	Const. Law	46	0	0	1	1	2	2 50
23	Principles of Criminal Liability in Nigerian Law- T. Aguda & Okagbue	Criminal Law	67	1	1	1	1	4	4 100
24	Okonkwo And Naish on Criminal Law In Nigeria - C.O. Okonkwo	Criminal Law	65	1	1	1	1	4	4 100

Table 6 Cont.

S/N	Title/Author	Subject	No. Of Citation	Universities				Total	% Of Total Availability
				ANSU	ESUT	NAU	UNN		
25	The Nigerian Criminal Trial Procedure-O.A. Onadeko	Criminal Law	65	0	0	1	0	1	25
26	Criminal Code Companion-E.O.Fakayode	Criminal Law	65	0	0	1	0	1	25
27	Criminal Procedure In Southern Nigeria - Oluwatoyin Doherty	Criminal Law	63	1	1	1	0	3	75
28	Criminal Procedure Act: Synoptic Guide- Olayide Olakanmi	Criminal Law	62	1	0	1	0	2	50
29	Criminal Procedure in Nigeria-Oluwatoyin Doherty	Criminal Law	62	1	0	1	0	2	50
30	Criminology And Criminal Justice - A.B Dambazu	Criminal Law	61	0	0	1	1	2	50
31	Law and Criminality-A.B. Dambazu	Criminal Law	55	0	0	1	1	2	50
32	Defences of Criminal Liability in Nigerian Law- Icharisu Chukkol	Criminal Law	50	0	0	1	0	1	25
33	Principles of Criminal Law in Nigeria-A Aguda	Criminal Law	48	1	1	1	0	3	75
34	History and Sources of Nigerian Criminal Law-A.G. Karibi Whyte	Criminal Law	40	0	0	1	0	1	25
35	History and Sources of Criminal Law-A.G.Karibi-Whyte	Criminal Law	40	0	0	1	0	1	25
36	An Introduction to Equity in Nigeria-G.Kodilinye	Equity	40	0	1	1	1	3	75
37	Modern Nigerian Law of Evidence (2nd ed.) - Fidelis Nwadialo.	Evidence	45	0	0	1	1	2	50
38	Law and Practice of Evidence in Nigeria - Afe Babalola	Evidence	43	0	0	1	0	1	25
39	Law and Practice Relating to Evidence in Nigeria (2 nd ed.) - Akinola Aguda.	Evidence	43	1	1	1	1	4	100
40	Legal Drafting and Conveyancing - S. O. Imhanobe	Property Law	60	0	0	1	1	2	50
41	A Practical Approach to Real Property I. O. Smith	Property Law	56	0	0	1	1	2	50
42	Nigerian Land Law -T.O.Elias	Property Law	53	1	0	1	1	3	75
43	Modern Nigerian Land Law-P.A.O.Oluyede	Property Law	52	0	0	1	1	2	50
44	Nigerian Land Law - B. O. Nwabueze	Property Law	51	1	1	1	1	4	100
45	Nigerian Law of Property - M. C. Okany	Property Law	50	1	1	1	1	4	100
46	Possession of Land -J.A.Omotola	Property Law	50	0	1	1	0	2	50
47	Issues in Contemporary Land Law-I.A.Umezulike	Property Law	46	0	1	1	1	3	75
48	Cases on the Land Use Act-J.A.Omotola	Property Law	45	1	1	1	1	4	100
49	Principles and Practice of Land Law-J.N.Egwumuo	Property Law	45	0	0	1	0	1	25
50	Land Use Act-J.A.Omotola	Property Law	45	1	1	1	1	4	100
51	Introduction to Nigerian Land Law-C.O.Okonkwo	Property Law	45	1	0	1	1	3	75

Table 6 Cont.

S/N	Title/Author	Subject	No. Of Citation	Universities				Total	% Of Total Availability
				ANSU	ESUT	NAU	UNN		
52	Law of Landlord and Tenant - Emeka Chianu	Property Law	44	0	1	1	1	3	75
53	The Iboh Law of Property-S.N.C. Obi	Property Law	42	1	0	1	0	2	50
54	Nigerian Law of Landlord and Tenant - M.O. Onwuamaegbu	Property Law	41	1	1	1	1	4	100
55	Nigerian Land Use Act- R.W.James	Property Law	40	0	1	1	0	2	50
56	Cases and Materials on Nigerian Land Law - Niki Tobi	Property Law	40	1	1	1	1	4	100
57	Land Use Act-I.O.Smith	Property Law	40	0	0	1	1	2	50
58	Manual of Igbo Customary Law-S.N.C.Obi	Property Law	40	0	0	1	0	1	25
59	Security of Title to Land in Nigeria-I.O.Smith	Property Law	40	1	0	1	0	2	50
60	Introduction to Nigerian Legal System - J. O. Asien	Legal Syst/Method	43	1	1	1	0	3	75
61	Introduction to Nigerian Legal Method-A.O.Sanni	Legal Syst/Method	45	0	0	1	0	1	25
62	Nigerian Legal System-A.O.Obilade	Legal Syst/Method	45	1	1	1	1	4	100
63	Nigerian Legal System-T.O. Elias	Legal Syst/Method	42	1	1	1	1	4	100
Total				34	23	63	31		
Percent Per University				54	37	100	49		

In Table 6, analysis of the citation was presented on the availability of compulsory core law courses textbooks. A total of 63 law textbooks from different subjects of law were identified as highly cited. From the analysis, Nnamdi Azikiwe University has all the cited texts in its collection. This accounts for 100% availability. Ranking second is Anambra State University which has 34 or 54%. University of Nigeria has 31 or 49%. While Enugu State University has 23 or 37%. The highest citation of 67 was received by *Principles of Criminal Liability in Nigerian Law* by T. Aguda & I. Okagbue. The four law libraries have it in their collection. Other textbooks that were available in all the four libraries studied are *Okonkwo and Naish on Criminal Law*, *Law and Practice Relating to Evidence in Nigeria (2nd ed.)* by Akinola Aguda, *Nigerian Legal System* by Obilade and *Nigerian Legal System* by T.O. Elias.

Despite the high rating these textbooks received, it is sad to note that out of the 63 texts identified, 10 were available only in Nnamdi Azikiwe University. These are *Judicialism in Commonwealth Africa* by B.O.Nwabueze, *Criminal Code Companion* E.O. Fakayode, *Defences of Criminal Liability in Nigerian Law* by Icharisu Chukkol, *History and Sources of Nigerian Criminal Law* by A.G. Karibi Whyte, *History and Sources of Criminal Law* by A.G.Karibi-Whyte, *The Nigerian Criminal Trial Procedure* by O.A. Onadeko, *Law and Practice of Evidence in Nigeria* by Afe Babalola, *Manual of Igbo Customary Law* by S.N.C.Obi, *Principles and Practice of Land Law* by J.N. Egwumuo, *Introduction to Nigerian Legal Method* by A.O.Sanni. A closer look at the table would also reveal that 23 texts out of the 63 were available only in just two law libraries. In all, only 12 textbooks were available in all the four law libraries studied.

Table 7: Availability of Cited Optional Core Law Textbooks

S/N	Optional Core Law Courses Textbooks	No. Of Citation	Universities				Total	% Of Total Availability
			ANSU	ESUT	NAU	UNN		
1	Nigeria Administrative Law- P.A Oluyede	41	0	1	1	1	3	75
2	Administrative Law-W.R. Wade	40	0	1	1	1	3	75
3	The Law of Arbitration in Nigeria-Gaus Ezejiolor	40	0	1	1	1	3	75
4	The Customary Law Manual - S.N.C. Obi	40	0	0	1	0	1	25
5	Labour Law- A. Emiola	40	1	1	1	1	4	100
6	Labour Law in Nigeria - E. E. Uvieghara	40	1	1	1	0	3	75
Total		241	2	5	6	4		
Percent Per University			33	83	100	67		

Result of the analysis in Table 7 shows that 6 textbooks were identified as most highly cited. It can be seen from the table that Nnamdi Azikiwe University has all the cited texts. Enugu State University has 5 out of the 6. This accounts for 83%. University of Nigeria has 4 out of the 6 (67%) while Anambra State University has just 2 (33%).

Labour Law by Emiola is the only text that is available in all the four law libraries. The availability status of the optional texts in Anambra State University was poor. It has only *Labour Law in Nigeria* by E. E. Uvieghara and *Labour Law* by Emiola out of the 6 texts cited.

Table 8: Availability of Foreign Law Journals

S/N	Journals (Foreign)	No. Of Citation	Universities				Total	% Of Total Availability
			ANSU	ESUT	NAU	UNN		
1	Harvard International Law Review	25	0	0	1	0	1	25
2	International Legal Materials	25	0	0	1	0	1	25
3	ILO Workshop Proceedings	24	0	1	0	0	1	25
4	Journal of African Law	23	0	0	1	0	1	25
5	Cambridge Law Journal	21	0	0	1	1	2	50
6	Cambridge Law Review	20	0	0	1	1	2	50
Total		117	0	1	5	2	8	
Percent Per University			0	16.7	83	33		

Table 8 presents result of the analysis on foreign law journals cited by undergraduate law students in their research project. A total of 6 foreign law journals frequently cited. The result indicates that none of the foreign journals is present in all the law libraries studied. *Cambridge Law Journal* and *Cambridge Law Review* were available in NAU and UNN only. *Harvard*

International Law Review which received the highest citation was available just in Nnamdi Azikiwe University law library only. The total figure show that ANSU has none of these journals in its collection, ESUT has 1 (16.7%), UNN has 2(33%) and NAU 5(83%) journals in their collection.

Table 9: Availability of Local Law Journal

S/N	Journals (Local)	No. Of Citation	Universities				Total	% Of Total Availability
			ANSU	ESUT	NAU	UNN		
1	Nigerian Bar Association Journal	37	1	1	1	1	4	100
2	Nigerian Law and Practice Journal	35	1	0	1	0	2	50
3	UNIZIK Law Journal	34	1	0	1	1	3	75
4	University of Benin Law Journal	30	1	0	1	1	3	75
5	Journal of Contemporary Legal Problems	25	0	0	0	0	0	0
6	Journal of Human Rights Law & Practice	24	0	0	1	0	1	25
7	Journal of Private and Property Law	23	1	1	1	1	4	100
8	AbiaStateUniversity Law Journal	21	0	1	1	0	2	50
9	Ikeja Bar Journal	21	0	0	0	0	0	0
10	Journal of Public and Private Law	21	0	0	1	1	2	50
11	Ilorin Bar Journal	20	0	0	1	0	1	25
Total		291	5	3	9	5	41	
Percent Per University			45	27	82	45	100	

Table 9 shows the result of the analysis on local law journals. From the table, 11 local journals were most frequently cited. Two journals namely *Ikeja Bar Journal* and *Journal of Contemporary Legal Problems* were not available in any of the law libraries studied. Only two journals, *Nigerian Bar Association Journal* and *Journal of Private and Property Law* were available in all the law libraries. The *Nigerian Bar Association Journal* is a publication of Nigerian Bar Association. The total figure shows that ANSU has 5(45%), ESUT 3(27%), UNN has 5(45%) and NAU 9(82%).

Research Question 3: What Challenges do Law Librarians Encounter in the Provision of Information Sources to Law Students in Faculty of Law Libraries in South East Nigeria?

Funding

The law librarians interviewed in the four law libraries reported that fund is a major barrier in the acquisition of information sources in their libraries. In the four law libraries, there is no separate budget for faculty of law libraries. The university librarian controls the library fund and consequently the law library budget. Acquisition of

information sources is centrally done at the main university library. They also reported that the major source of fund for these law libraries is government subvention the university receives from either the federal government or the state government as the case may be. From the interview each law library has its own peculiar funding problem. At the University of Nigeria, the law librarian reported that the university management do not release all the funds meant for maintenance of the library such as library registration, fees collected from over due books are paid into the university account. This particular practice also applies in Nnamdi Azikiwe University and Anambra State University. The University of Nigeria law librarian further reported that that request for the release of such funds goes into restrictive bottleneck. The acquisition of law resources at the university is further compounded by the fact that the Faculty of Law does not see the law library as a critical area except during accreditation.

The level of funding at the state university is worse. The law librarians at the Anambra State University and Enugu State University of Technology lament that state government subvention to the university is very poor and this affects collection development of law resources at the law libraries. The two law librarians stated categorically that the law library has no meaningful internally generated revenue. Apart from state government subvention to the university which in most cases is grossly inadequate, donations from individuals and donor agencies trickle is once in a while. According to them such donations in many cases do not address their local needs.

The law librarians also reported that the university receives some relief through the TET Fund but this happens once in a while. Paucity of fund is even worse in the state university. Enugu State University failed National Universities Commission accreditation in 2012 as a result of inadequate facilities. In all, responses gathered during the interview show that law libraries owned by the federal government is better funded than law libraries in state universities.

From the interview report, other problems which affect the provision of information resources to law students in the libraries bothers on the bureaucratic process which does not give the law librarians freedom to select and process required materials. They also have the problem of shortage of accommodation both to display acquired materials and reading space. Facilities that will enhance effective utilization of information resources such as regular supply of electricity supply is also lacking.

Research Question 4: *What Strategies can Law Librarians Adopt to Improve the Availability and Utilization of Information Sources Cited.*

Funding

The four law librarians recommend that the university management should create a separate or dedicated book vote for acquisition of information resources at the law library. Both the dean of law and the law librarian should manage such fund. The need for improved funding was also stressed. Subvention to the university and the law library in particular should be increased in view of current economic reality in Nigeria. Also in view of the paucity of fund in many government establishments in Nigeria, they recommend that

law libraries should explore other avenues for improved funding through internally generated revenue. They also recommend readers' registration at the beginning of every session. None of the law libraries visited imposed registration levy on their library users. The amount each student will pay is however to be determined by each faculty of law. Other fee based services they suggested include fine from overdue books, consultancy services etc. Funds can also accrue from web based services such as internet browsing, scanning etc. All the internally generated revenue should be paid into the faculty of law account. Both the dean of law and the law librarian should be signatory to such account.

The Tertiary Education Trust Fund as an intervention strategy by the federal government should regard collection development at the law library as a critical area. The university management should also include the law librarian as a member of the committee that manage such funds.

Faculty of Law libraries should also solicit for the assistance of donor agencies both in Nigeria and beyond. To enhance the acquisition and processing of information resources in these libraries, they recommend that both the acquisition and cataloguing of information resources should be done at the law library instead of at the main library. This will enhance speedy availability of these materials to law students. The law librarians also stressed the need for steady supply of electricity and other facilities in these libraries.

Discussion of Findings

The Types of cited sources in the projects

The result of the findings showed that among secondary sources of law cited, textbooks are the dominant sources cited in undergraduate research projects in law. Legal textbooks according to Dada (2006) constitute the bulk of a law library and can therefore be regarded as the most important single entity available for the conduct of legal research. Apart from citations in various academic papers, the opinions and view of some of the legal textbook writers have been referred to with approval in court proceedings. The study by Nkiko & Adetoro (2007) at the Covenant University Library confirmed students' research interest in textbooks. The authors of the research projects in that study cited heavily from textbook holdings of the university library.

Burma (2011) also reaffirms students' research interest in textbooks in the study he carried out on dissertations of law submitted to University of New Delhi. Faculty of law libraries in Nigeria have received prescribed list of textbooks by the two accrediting bodies in law namely Council of Legal Education and National Universities Commission. This list serves as checklist during the accreditation exercise. Specifically, the National Universities Commission recommends that every faculty of law library should have all the major textbooks on each course taught in the faculty of law of the university concerned. From this result, it is obvious that three of these law libraries namely Enugu State University of Technology, Anambra State University, and University of Nigeria do not have up to 30% of the cited textbooks in their collection. This result is also an indication that law students in these institutions use either their private collection or source for these textbooks elsewhere. This situation is worrisome because availability of information sources means

ensuring their presence in the library for immediate use. Aguolu and Aguolu (2002) expressed this fear when they observed that once the use encounters difficulty in locating and using the material, frustration sets in and this may affect the quality of such research. This situation report also explains why many final year law students make frantic effort moving from one institution to another sourcing for materials with which to write their research report.

The findings of the study also reveal that undergraduate law students cite law journal in their research projects. Journal citation received 608 citations or 5.85%. Notwithstanding the low citation this information source received in this study, law journals are the most current sources of research materials in the law library because of their frequency of publication. Some are either published monthly, quarterly, half yearly or biannually. Law journals according to Dada (2006) contain scholars, articles, commentaries, notes and comments on current legal problems. Legal periodicals often times contain book reviews, seminars, roundtables and conference announcements.

Twenty law journals with 20 citations and above were identified. Out of this number, 6 are foreign journals. *Harvard International Law Review* and *International Legal Materials* received 25 citations. Others in this category are *ILO Workshop Proceedings*, *Journal of African Law*, *Cambridge Law Journal* and *Cambridge Law Review*. It is pertinent to note that these are reputable law journals which are also available in Hein Online database. Some of them are included in the checklist for faculty of law library accreditation by the Council of Legal Education. Apart from the foreign law journals, 13 local journals were rated as most frequently cited. The *Nigerian Bar Association Journal* has the highest rating of 37 citations. Other highly cited local journals include *Nigerian Law and Practice Journal*, *UNIZIK Law Journal* and *University of Benin Law Journal*. Some of them are also included in the checklist for faculty of law library accreditation.

Unavailability of cited sources in these law libraries also affects the accreditation status of these faculties of law. The faculty of law library is not only essential but crucial to the study and practice of the legal profession. Many faculties of law in Nigeria have been denied accreditation in the recent past because of poor library facilities. A few years ago, faculties of law in University of Nigeria, Enugu State University of Technology and Anambra State University have been denied accreditation and this affected their admission quota at the Nigerian Law School. From the above statistics, Nnamdi Azikiwe seems to have fared better than the other three law libraries because it has up to 67.98% of the cited sources. This report though commendable still leaves room for further improvement. At present, it has full accreditation status in Nigeria. It came second to University of Lagos in 2007 accreditation.

Problems Law Libraries Encounter in the Provision of Information Resources to Law Students.

Interview conducted on the law librarians revealed that the major problems law libraries face in the provision of information sources to law students is paucity of funds. Faculty of law libraries are under the control of university librarians. There is also no separate book vote for the law library; as such all purchases are carried out at the main

university library. The problem of poor funding is even worse at the state universities namely Enugu State University of Technology, and Anambra State University. The major source of fund in these libraries is subvention from the state government.

This bureaucratic arrangement which empowered the university librarian to control the acquisition of resources for the law library is responsible for the late arrival of the acquired materials at the law library. In the National Universities Commission Benchmark, it was clearly stated that in the acquisition of library holdings in the law library, law faculties must be consulted and their recommendations seriously considered. In other words, acquisitions by law libraries should be guided by the recommendations of the faculties. It further stated that the need to update the holdings of law library should be boldly underlined. New issues of law reports and journals and current editions of books should be acquired from time to time. Out-of-date reports and textbooks are sure to mislead rather than help students and researchers. They are therefore dangerous and almost useless except to a legal historian.

Generally there is poor ICT infrastructure, poor electricity supply and accommodation problem in these law libraries. The same benchmark stated that faculty of law libraries should be sufficiently large and roomy to have reasonable space for book stacks, reading space (which should sit 25% - 30% students at a time) and staff offices. In addition, law libraries should have electronic facilities for downloading current information which should be accessible to staff and students. The interview report also revealed that law librarians were not empowered to attend professional conferences, workshops and in-service training. These staff development programmes would have equipped the law librarians to keep abreast of current trends in law librarianship.

Strategies/ Measures Law Libraries can Adopt to Enhance the Availability and utilization of cited source.

The law librarians recommend improved funding and creation of a dedicate book vote for law libraries. This account is to be domiciled at the faculty of law to be managed by the Dean of Law and the law librarian. Government subvention to law libraries should be increased through a robust budget for the law library in view of the fact that law libraries are regarded as the laboratory of law students.

To enhance the relevance and timely availability of information resources at the law library, both the acquisition and processing of law materials should be carried out at the law library. These processes should be digitized as well. Automation of all law library operations was advocated. Improving ICT infrastructure at the law library would mean providing adequate budget for its establishment and maintenance. Each law faculty requires Internet connectivity with robust bandwidth. Consequently law libraries should procure an alternative power supply with robust KVA. Staff of the law library who will man these processes should be sponsored regularly to conferences, seminars, workshops and in-service training for them to keep abreast of latest development in ICT infrastructure. Generally, strict compliance with the provisions of the National Universities

Commission on Faculty of Law libraries will help check the lapses in these law libraries.

The implication of this finding also has a far reaching effect on the faculty of law. Many faculties of law in Nigeria have either been denied accreditation or granted partial accreditation by both the National Universities Commission and the Council of Legal Education due to inadequacy of their library resources. The findings equally have some implications for the law students in terms of availability of research materials at the law library. The law students may have to resort to making private arrangement for those research materials which are not in the law library. Similarly if the unavailability of cited sources in the law library is not checked it may result to plagiarism - a situation where students copy from completed research projects without acknowledging the original author. The unavailability of cited sources in these law libraries also has a far reaching effect on quality of law graduates being produced and the future of the legal profession in Nigeria.

The finding of the study has raised the nagging issue of lack of autonomy of faculty of law libraries in Nigeria. This administrative arrangement has slowed down the pace of development in law libraries. Both the choice of materials to be procured and the processing of such materials is still a problem in most of these law libraries. Faculty law libraries in Nigeria require some degree of viable autonomy to function as expected.

The finding on the availability of cited sources in the faculty of law libraries made some shocking revelations. None of the law libraries have all the cited sources in its collections. This shows the state of faculty of law libraries in Nigeria. Both the university and all stake holders in the funding of faculty law libraries should devise a strategy of resuscitating these law libraries to actually serve as the laboratory of law students in Nigeria.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study, the following recommendations were made:

1. Faculty of law libraries in Nigeria should improve on their acquisition of current law reports, statutes and textbooks since these are the dominant sources undergraduate law students use in their research projects.
2. The National Universities Commission and the Council of Legal Education have prescribed a list of primary and secondary sources which every faculty of law in Nigeria must have in its collection. Faculties of law libraries should adhere to this benchmark in the acquisition and management of its resources. Adherence to this list will take care of the research needs of law students.
3. There are a number of online databases in law such as Lexis Nexis, Westlaw, Legalpedia, Law Pavilion and others which the Council of Legal Education and National Universities Commission have prescribed for every faculty of law. Law libraries should endeavour to subscribe to them and also create an enabling environment for robust Internet access and information communication facilities. Law students should engage themselves in training that will enable them to acquire

the necessary ICT skills needed to access these electronic resources.

4. Faculty of law libraries should use the identified frequently cited sources as guide during the acquisition of information sources so as to meet the research needs of law students.
5. The National Universities Commission stated clearly in its 2007 Benchmark that faculty of law library is the laboratory of law students. The NUC as the supervising ministry should impress this on the minds of all stakeholders in the funding of legal education. Acquisition of information sources at the law library should receive priority attention during budget allocation to the university.
6. Autonomy of faculty of law libraries can no longer be compromised. Incidentally this administrative arrangement is a creation of the law establishing the university which vested the control of all faculty libraries on the university librarian. Time has come for a review and amendment of this law.
7. The procedure for the selection and acquisition of information sources at the law library has been prescribed by the 2007 NUC Benchmark. What is now required is the enforcement in all faculty of law libraries in Nigeria.
8. Faculty of law library development should be included in the critical area of the TET fund project. This will help to improve the facilities of the law libraries.
9. Paucity of funds is endemic in virtually all government establishments in Nigeria. Time has come for faculty of law libraries to look inwards and devise strategies on how to raise funds through fee based services and partnership with some donor agencies.
10. Staff of the library should be sponsored to conferences, seminars, workshops and in service training. This will help to check lethargy among law librarians and also help them keep abreast with recent development in law librarianship.
11. Accreditation exercise at the universities by both the National Universities Commission and the Council of Legal Education should be carried out on a regular basis. Experience has shown that frantic effort universities make to meet up with the demands of the accrediting body has helped to improve the facilities in faculty of law libraries in Nigeria.

Conclusion

The study is a citation analysis of secondary sources of undergraduate law students cite in their research projects in faculty of law libraries in Anambra and Enugu States of Nigeria. It also sought to find out the availability of those cited resources in these libraries. The result of the analysis shows that law students who use these libraries predominantly cite more of textbooks and journals and that most of these cited sources were not available in these libraries.

References

1. Aguolu, C.C.& Aguolu, I. E. (2002). *Libraries and information management in Nigeria*. Maiduguri: Ed- Linform Services.
2. Aina, L. O. & Ajiferuke, I. S. Y. (2002). *Research methodologies in information sciences*. In L. O. Aina (ed). *Research in information science: African perspective*. Ibadan: Stirling-Horden.

3. Americalegalnet (2006) Legal Notes. Retrieved from <http://profius/24sp/laws34/primary.htm> on July 20, 2011.
4. Asein, J. O. (2005) *Introduction to Nigerian legal system* Ibadan: Sam Bookman Publishers.
5. Bavelas, J. B. (1978). *The social psychology of citations*. Canadian Psychological Review 19. p. 160.
6. Buckland, M. (1975). *Book Availability and the Library User*. New York: Pergamon Press.
7. Dada, T. O. (2011) *Law Librarianship and Legal Research in the Digital Age*. Lagos: Nigerian Institute of Advanced Legal Studies.
8. Ekundayo, A. (2000). *Legal Hints* 2nd ed. Lagos: Nigerian Institute of Advanced Legal Studies.
9. Federal Republic of Nigeria (1999) *Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria* Abuja : Government Press.
10. Garner, B. (2004) *Black's Law Dictionary*. 8th. Ed. St Paul Minn: Thompson West.
11. Hunter, J. & College, G. (2014). The importance of citation. Retrieved from web.grinnel.edu/Dean/Tutorial/EUS/IC.pdf
12. Ibeh, C. E.(2011). *Nature of law and the legal system in Nigeria*. In Greg C. Nwakoby (Ed.)*Fundamentals of the Nigerian legal system*(pp.381-396) Chennai:Bekaam Printers.
13. Ibeum, M. O. & Madu, I. D. (2002). *Application of analysis to Library Management with reference to Nigeria fisheries and aquatic science literature*. African Journal of Library, Achieves and Information Science. 2 (2): 60-69.
14. Ikpeze, O. V C..(2011) *The Legal profession and its regulations in the 21st century Nigeria*. In Greg C. Nwakoby (Ed.)*Fundamentals of the Nigerian legal system*(pp.381-396) Chennai:Bekaam Printers.
15. Jegede, O. (1977). *Problems of acquisition of Library materials in a developing country*: University of Lagos experience. International Library Review. 9 (2) :225-239.
16. King Country Law Library (2008). Sources of the Law-federal, state & local. Retrieved from www.kcll.org on July 19, 2011.
17. Legal Information Institute (2010) Legal research. Retrieved from http://topics.law.cornell.edu/wex/legal_research on July 19, 2011.
18. Littlewood, S. (2004). *The legal profession in African territories*. In Essays in honour of Hon. Justice M. O. Onalaja. Lagos: Diamond Publications.
19. Meho, L. I. (2007). The rise and rise of citation analysis. Physics World. Retrieved from www.physicsworld.org on July 23, 2008.
20. Nikko, C. & Adetoro, N. (2007). Pioneer bachelor degree citation analysis of Covenant University students' research projects. *Library Philosophy and Practice*. Retrieved from <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/libphi/prac/150> on August 6, 2008.
21. Obidinma, A.E. & Ezech, A.G.(2011). *Legal Research* In Greg C. Nwakoby (Ed.) *Fundamentals of the Nigerian legal system* (pp.362-380) Chennai:Bekaam Printers.
22. Ogunrobi, S. A. (1988). Citation Analysis in the Ilorin Journal of Education; an exploratory study. Retrieved from <http://www.ijeunilorin.net> on August 30, 2008.
23. Okiy, R. B. A (2003) Citation analysis of educational dissertations at the Delta State University, Abraka. *Collection Building*. 22(4): 158-161.
24. Omekwu, C. & Atinmo, M. I. (1998). Author and journal citation patterns of agricultural communication researchers at the University of Ibadan. *African Journal of Libraries, Achieves and Information Science*. 8 (2): 105-112.
25. Onadeko, O. (2005). Accreditation and Legal education in Nigeria. Paper presented at the Nigerian Institute of Advanced legal Studies biennial national workshop for Librarians in Lagos, June 21-23.
26. Onalaja, M. O. (2010) Problem of legal education in Nigeria. Retrieved from <http://www.walmiandco.com/Publication/ACCREDITATION> on August 3, 2011.
27. Pritchard, A.(1969) 'Statistical Bibliography or Bibliometrics?', *Journal of Documentation*, 25(4), 348-349. https://www.academia.edu/598618/Statistical_bibliography_or_bibliometrics.
28. Regents (2015). Citation analysis guide tags:Altmetrics, bibliometrics, citation analysis, google scholar, h index, impact factor, patents and trademarks, scopus, web of science. Retrieved from <http://guides.lib.umich.edu/content>.
29. Rubin, R. (2010). *Foundations of library and information science* (3rd ed.). New York: Neal-Schuman Publishers.
30. Sam, J. & Tackie, S. N. B. (2007). Citation analysis of dissertations accepted by the Department of Information Studies, University of Ghana, Legon. *African Journal of Library, Achieves & Information Science*. 17 (2): 117-124.
31. Shapiro, F. (1991). The most cited articles. The Yale Law Journal. Retrieved from <http://www.yalelawjournal.org/history> on July 19, 2011.
32. Sylvia, M. (1998). Citation analysis as an unobtrusive method for journal collection evaluation using psychology students research bibliographies. *Collection Building* 17 (1).
33. Szu-Chia, L. (2007) Use of information resources in writing up dissertation: a citation analysis. Retrieved from http://docs.google.com/viewer?av&9=cache:OjuyUQ_mhkkj:icce2007.dei.uc/pt/proceedings/papers/257.pdf on March 5, 2010.
34. The Free Dictionary (2011) Shepard's Citations. Retrieved from [http:// legal-dictionary, the freedictionary.com /Shepard's + Citations](http://legal-dictionary.the freedictionary.com /Shepard's + Citations) on July 19, 2011.
35. Thomson, R. (2014). Whitepaper using bibliometrics: A guide to evaluating research performance with citation data. Retrieved from researchanalytics.thomson.com/researchanalytics/cu/inc-support/using-biblio
36. Ugah, A. D. (2008) Availability and accessibility of information sources and the use on Library services at Michael Okpara University of Agriculture. *Library Philosophy ed. Practice*. May 1 - 9.
37. White, E. C. (1985) Bibliometrics: from curiosity to convention. *Special Libraries*. 76: 35-42.